

The Impact of Effective Organisational Communication on Employees' Productivity

Nur Syahira Md Subre

Asia Pacific University of Technology and Innovation

syahira.subre@apu.edu.my

Abstract

Communication is a crucial part of every organisation since it promotes employee collaboration, which impacts organisational performance and decision-making. Despite its apparent simplicity, research has shown that communication can either support or undermine an organisation. For an organisation to succeed, having a successful communication strategy is crucial. If communication is not effective when applied in an organisational setting, it can affect interdepartmental working relationships, productivity, and morale. Unresolved communication problems may have a negative impact on the company's profitability, raise turnover, and produce mistakes that damage its reputation. This study investigates the effect of organisational communication towards employees' productivity and the significant relationship between educational background and employees' organisational communication. This study was conducted using a set of questionnaires that were sent to 83 respondents. The collected data was analysed by using Cronbach Alpha in SPSS software. The results showed that there is a significant relationship between employees' educational background and organisational communication. The researcher recommends future research should spend more time on conducting the research topic as various factors can influence the relationship between communication and employees' productivity.

Keywords: *Educational Background, Effective Communication, Employees' Engagement, Employees' Productivity, Organisational Communication*

1.0 Introduction

Cohesion in the workplace can be created and maintained with communication. Additionally, effective communication is essential for achieving the organisation's objectives, duties, and management. Therefore, it is essential for achieving these goals to consider how individuals vary at work. Since each person adds their individuality to the organisation, their contributions can improve a workplace's productivity, work quality, relationships, and even loyalty. Similarly, poor

communication of the company's goals can lead to missed deadlines, false assumptions about goals, and ultimately problems at work (Cletus et al., 2018).

The process of exchanging ideas, thoughts, opinions, knowledge, and facts to ensure that the message is understood and accepted with clarity and purpose is known as effective communication. Effective communication makes both the sender and the recipient happy. Sapungan et al. (2019) further explained that information overload obstructs effective organisational communication. When emails, notes, bulletins, announcements, and reminders are frequently distributed, employees need clarification about what to do first. Making many announcements confuses the part of the employee and adds extra labour to their job. Furthermore, too much information from these media overwhelms a person's ability to comprehend the message effectively. However, some employees are no longer concerned because they used to interact with these media daily.

Not only that, the meaning of communication is also influenced by the education levels of the sender and recipient. Communication will be successful if their educational backgrounds are similar. This is frequently accurate since they share comparable perspectives, ways of thinking, and levels of understanding (Salem, 2019). This is supported by Gendron (2022) who says that employees with low education perform worse and have lower retention rates. Lack of enough education will result in employees producing less work of lower quality. Less education and experience also translate into lower performance, which yields lesser earnings. This kind of work frequently results in mistakes, poor quality, and wasted time repeating tasks. Additionally, it has a lot of negative effects on stakeholders including clients, business partners, and suppliers.

Employees from different educational backgrounds will also have communication barriers. While employees with higher educational backgrounds could read an email without asking the person writing it, low-educated employees may need time to understand it and even need to find the person who wrote it and ask them to explain it (Stefania & Spiridnova, 2022). Not only that, employees from different backgrounds may also have a knowledge gap. A knowledge gap refers to the disparity between an employee's existing knowledge and the information required by their organization. In simple terms, it occurs when an employee faces a task but lacks the necessary understanding to know how to accomplish it (Liszniansky, 2021).

Employees with different backgrounds may also have language barriers in them (Habas, 2020). For example, in the Malaysian context, the organisation is a diverse workplace which requires employees to speak Malay or English most of the time. Employees with different educational backgrounds may face difficulty in understanding the messages. Verbal communication is crucial in every context, yet translation errors can cause words to lose their intended meaning. A word may be misconstrued or misread by the other person if one person is unsure of its precise meaning, which could result in a disagreement of opinion (Habas, 2020).

This study aims to identify the most frequent effect of organisational communication towards employees' productivity and to investigate the significant relationship between educational background and employees' organisational communication. The following sections of the study are presented: literature review, methodology, results, discussion, and conclusion.

2.0 Literature review

2.1 Importance of Effective Communication in an Organisation

According to Kalogiannidis (2021), effective communication is crucial because it helps employees understand the tasks they must complete, typically given to them by managers or supervisors. Additionally, Ahmed et al. (2020) also outlined that managers can correctly explain to employees how tasks are to be completed and support them in enhancing their performance. This increases productivity in terms of quantity and quality, enabling the business to increase sales and ultimately maximise profit. The act of communicating is helpful during the decision-making process.

In organisations, everyone has different viewpoints on how to do something. According to Markovic and Salamzadeh (2018), negating someone's point of view without supporting evidence and specific examples of behaviour or actions considered inappropriate, unprofessional, or unpleasant does not help the problem. However, it is crucial to maintain communication until the conversation is over. Closure indicates that all of the concerns have been discussed and that, even though the other party did not agree with someone, he or she listened to someone in a non-threatening, non-defensive setting and understood what someone said. Discussing the conflict openly and providing a solution to achieve a standard agreement requires effective communication. For example, an employee is late in submitting the report. So, the accountant cannot finish their jobs on time due to a lack of numbers.

2.2 The Impact of Employee Engagement towards Organisational Performance

Employee engagement is a crucial variable affecting organisational performance, and leaders and managers worldwide have realized this. According to Setiyani et al. (2019), employee engagement can be qualified according to the experts. This combines advocacy, pride, satisfaction, and retention. In recent years, there has been much discussion on employee engagement. There is still uncertainty, though, because there are different viewpoints on the factors that positively or negatively impact employee engagement. Research findings can be impacted by time, location, and the objects being studied. Setiyani et al. (2019) claim that a good company may be identified by having a high degree of employee engagement, which is demonstrated by various employee actions. They are dedicated to sticking with the company where they work, speak highly of it, and feel inspired to put in extra effort to further the company's objectives.

While working toward the organisation's goals and strategies, engagement requires the deployment of emotional, cognitive, and behavioural energy. Tanveera et al. (2020) stated that all employees must work together to be effective and efficient. While ensuring sustained compliance in the workplace, committed employees must share, support, collaborate, create a positive standard work environment, and feel good on a psychological, social, or organisational level. When the time has passed, and it is tough to finish working, engagement is demonstrated by positive attention to employee involvement. It is developed from ideas about organisational participation, public action, and job satisfaction, but it is considerably more comprehensive than "motivation" and "involvement" in management literature. Teo et al. (2020) mentioned the mutual relationship between employees and the organisation usually constitutes employee engagement. The human resources division must address the problem of employee engagement because it is crucial to achieving organisational success and competitiveness and because motivated employees can

improve organisational performance. Employees more invested in their jobs put out more effort and are more likely to perform duties above and beyond what is expected (Tanveera et al., 2020).

Paais and Pattiruhu (2020) suggest that engagement is a patchwork that connects the roles of rewarding hard work and employee job satisfaction. Antecedents result from experiencing job satisfaction. An employee's preference for their career is determined by whether their current position inspires them. Working to pay for personal wants and needs in life is not always a tangible activity. However, in addition to that, one's vocation and career must also be a source of remarkable inspiration. Moletsane et al. (2019) further explain that when employees are engaged and dedicated, organisational performance also rises. It was demonstrated that there is a connection between employee engagement and organisational performance. Additionally, Ibrahim and Daniel (2019) also discovered that the feelings of employees regarding their emotions, communication, the workplace environment, leadership, and their devotion to their jobs all affected employee engagement.

2.3 The Importance of Effective Communication towards Employees' Productivity at Workplace

Mercader et al. (2021) explained that in an analysis that takes into account three dimensions, namely, the completion of tasks to be completed, the satisfaction of team members, and the intention to continue in the same teams, it penetrates organisational communication, focuses on it, and applied it vertically, horizontally, and diagonally in its influence on the effectiveness of work teams. The way and substance of team members' voices affect and sometimes even impact the procedures and results of team performance, safety, and productivity. Therefore, leaders play an essential role in influencing employees to be involved in communicating effectively. Kalogiannidis (2020) asserts that the most effective managers or leaders have a thorough understanding of the various facets of communication and how they generally affect the environment or structure of the organisation. Knowing the value of business communication allows managers to enhance the nature of communication within the company, which over time produces favourable outcomes, particularly concerning employees' productivity performance. Kalogiannidis (2020) also explains that good communication is a tried-and-true method for assisting employees in carrying out their organisational responsibilities. Managers must be willing to encourage open communication among the many departmental units of an organisation to increase productivity.

When employees are encouraged to communicate openly, they are more effective in completing their jobs. According to Amin (2022), each employee is given precise information about work that can be carried out without any errors or misunderstandings. Because accurate information is gained in relation to the tasks completed, effective communication favours workplace efficiency. Employee innovation and creativity positively impact their ability to accomplish their jobs with more productivity as a result of their ability to transform ineffective old systems into more efficient new ones. Karoso et al. (2022) highlighted that because the ideas offered are so helpful to the employees' daily activities, creativity and innovation help to boost job productivity. While needing the same input, productivity increases lead to higher output levels. By lowering the required financial investment in daily necessities, this feature is a value-added process that can significantly raise living standards, making consumers wealthier and businesses more profitable.

2.4 The Effects of Education Background towards Organisational Communication among Employees

Educational background is a better indicator of success in the job market than tests of cognitive abilities, personality traits, and intra-and interpersonal competencies. In comparison to workers who had attended school for fewer years, those with more education are better able to perform a given task, learn more from complex task training, and allocate work resources more effectively. Stachová et al. (2019) also stated that employee education can be thought of as a continuous process in which the development and modification of working behaviour, as well as the degree of knowledge, skills and motivation of employers, occur as a result of learning based on a variety of instructional strategies. It causes the gap between the current competencies of employees and the demands placed on them to narrow.

An example of a high-performance culture in the workplace is communication. Workplace communication is the process of exchanging ideas and information inside an organisation. However, clear communication happens when a message is transmitted and understood by both parties. Effective communication is critical to success and enjoyment in all areas of life. Effective workplace communication for all business objectives opens a new window and is essential (Kashyap, 2021). However, when employees come from different backgrounds organisational communication cannot be practised effectively. A person's ego and attitude frequently prevent teamwork and other workplace endeavours if not appropriately addressed. For instance, one person might interrupt another while they are working at a conference or refuse to concede defeat in an argument when the other person is correct. It takes greater listening or refusing to concede defeat in an argument when the other person is correct.

3.0 Research Methodology

Samples that were involved in this quantitative study were 83 respondents from the retail industry making up the sample size for this study. There are 3 retail companies's employees involved in the survey, namely AEON Group, Lotus's Malaysia and Tong Kat Resources Sdn Bhd. Every respondent is asked to respond honestly during the questionnaire process to prevent inaccurate data.

A well-designed questionnaire was created to collect important data. 15 questions on the impact of effective communication in an organisation are included in the study's questionnaire. To gather the necessary data a questionnaire was distributed. Sample selection was random. The questionnaire was sent by using a Google Form link and information was gathered. Respondents should answer all the questions to meet the study's goals. The questions of the questionnaire would have to first undergo a comprehensive evaluation by the researcher and only then be sent out to respondents. However, the researcher might feasibly presume the interest ideas' structure. There are 15 questions in this survey, divided into two parts, with Likert scale options and multiple-choice. The survey is broken up into three sections. The first section is getting the demographic data of the respondents. The second section is about the impact of using effective communication in an organisation. Lastly, the third section is about the impact of effective communication in organisations on employees' productivity. The questionnaires will be sent out online through social media platforms. Facebook, Instagram, and WhatsApp will be the main selected platforms. All data were calculated after that.

4.0 Findings

4.1 Demographic Background

In this study, the total of respondents is 83. 71 out of 83 respondents most of them are female which contributed 85.5%. Male respondents comprised 14.5%, with only 12 respondents. The majority of those who responded, 66% of them are under the age of 25, making up 79.5% of the total percentage. The lowest percentage is 1.2% which falls to the age of 36 to 40 years old with only 1 person.

Among 83 of the respondents, 63 of them were junior executives which occupied 75.9% in this study. Besides, there are 16 of the respondents were senior executives made up 19.3%, 3 of them were in manager positions at 3.6% and there was only 1 person who was in a senior manager position at 1.2%. Besides, 54 of them are degree holders which occupied 65.1% in this study. SPM and Diploma holders shared a similar number of respondents, which occupied 13 or 15.7%; for Diploma was 12 or 14.5%. Not only that, STPM and Master holders both have 2 respondents, at 2.4%. There are no PhD holders in this study. In addition, most of the respondents had less than 1 year of working experience with 39 at 47%. 22 respondents have 1 to 3 years of working experience, which contributed 26%. Furthermore, only 14 respondents, or 16.9%, had 4 to 6 years of working experience. Thus, the smallest category consisted of just 4 respondents with either 7 to 9 years or more than 9 years of work experience, accounting for just 4.8% of the total.

4.2 Most Frequent Effect of Organisational Communication Towards Employees' Productivity

The results showed that "Organisational communication enhances the relationships between managers and employees" had the highest mean score ($M=3.47$, $SD=1.124$), which shows that the respondents agreed communication in the organisation can enhance the relationships with the manager. Besides, the statement "Organisational communication provides clear leadership messages regarding organisational goals and objectives" had the second highest mean score ($M=3.21$, $SD=1.112$). This means that the respondents agreed organisational communication makes them clear about the organisational goals and objectives. Not only that, but the statement also "Organisational communication facilitates efficient and timely information sharing" is the last statement to have the higher mean score ($M=2.57$, $SD=1.107$) among the 5 statements. This result shows that the respondents think that communication is important in organisations to deliver information on time and efficiently.

Table 1: Most Frequent Effect of Organisational Communication Towards Employees' Productivity

Item	Mean	Standard Deviation
Organisational communication enhances the relationships between managers and employees.	3.47	1.124
Organisational communication provides clear leadership messages regarding organisational goals and objectives.	3.21	1.112

Organisational communication facilitates the efficient and timely information sharing	2.57	1.107
Organisational communication allows the management to organise the employees and the business better.	2.21	1.083
Organisational communication meets the information that employees want to know more about.	2.07	1.009

4.3 Relationship Between Educational Background and Employees’ Organisational Communication

The result from Table 2 demonstrates that there is a significant relationship between educational background and employees’ organisational communication ($r=0.807$, $p < 0.05$). According to Kwak (2023), to compare with the significance probability value or p-value, in many research, the level of significance is set at 0.05. A p-value of 0.05 or less is considered “significant” while a p-value of 0.05 or more is considered “not significant”. In conclusion, there is a significant relationship between educational background and organisational communication among the employees.

Table 2: Relationship Between Educational Background and Employees’ Organisational Communication

Variable	Employees’ organisational communication	
	r-value	p-value
Educational background	.807	.000

5.0 Discussion

Based on the findings of the study, organisational communication enhances the relationships between managers and employees. Organisational communication provides clear leadership messages regarding organisational goals and objectives. Good communication between managers and employees promotes clarity, reduces misunderstandings, develops trust and assures alignment with organisational goals. The result is aligned with the research done by Ali et al. (2021), where adopting transparent internal communication shows that organisation leaders genuinely care about preserving or improving connections with employees. The opposite of secrecy, transparency is characterised by openness. Their findings showed that transparent communication is measured by 3 dimensions; participation, accountability and participation, the result demonstrates good reliability. Transparent communication is a highly desirable quality of internal communication. Additionally, Bojadjev and Vaneva (2021) discovered a strong correlation between transparent internal communication and employee's trust in the organisation. In keeping with this, researchers contend that an organisation’s efforts to practise transparent communication send a message to employees that the organisation is forthright, honest, and open and would take employees’ concerns and feedback into account. In terms of leadership messages, Lee et al. (2021) mentioned in their study that one of the most researched approaches to leadership is transformational leadership. Inspirational motivation, one of four characteristics that define transformational

leadership, is demonstrated when leaders foresee a desirable future, inspire followers to perform at higher levels, and help them accomplish shared goals. Not only that, to address the requirements of their workforce, transformational leaders need to develop a mission, or vision, that communicates the strategic direction of the company. They inspire employees to adopt new perspectives and seize new chances intellectually by portraying change as an opportunity for personal development. They can also put together a team to offer coaching and direction to guarantee that employees adjust to the new environment without any difficulty (Lee et. al, 2021).

Based on research findings, it can be demonstrated that there is a significant relationship between employees' educational background and their organisational communication. According to Rismayadi and Sumarni (2023), the level and level of education is the stage of education that is set according to the extent of learner growth, the objectives to be met, and the capacities developed. To shape, prepare, foster, and develop human resource qualities that are crucial to future success, education serves as a foundation. When it comes to education, it's important to match the employee's most recent degree of education to the requirements of the position held and to match their formal education to the type of work they will be doing. Therefore, employees with a higher level of education perform better in verbal and written communication. They can more effectively convey ideas and contribute to organisational strategy compared to those who have a lower education level. In addition, Ramadhani and Simanjuntak (2020) also supported the research findings, their research mentioned that learning enhances one's potential, knowledge, interests, and sense of fulfilment while also having an impact on one's organisation's performance and, in a broader sense, the entire society, education is a human need. Since the initial publications in the organisational, management, and behavioural theories were published, education and training have been acknowledged as crucial components of both individual and organisational growth.

Theoreticians were concerned with its significance for the individual, their motivation, and their development, as well as its significance for the growth and success of the organisation as a whole. The study supports the findings of the study done by AP and Leon (2021) which argued that a person's career may not always correspond to their actual skills or area of competence. This imbalance frequently results from the intense rivalry for job prospects. Many employees struggle to perform well because they are put in roles that don't fit their skill sets. Due to these difficulties and their lack of experience in their given roles, they may feel less satisfied with their jobs and less motivated to work. As a result, a significant number of employees wind up carrying out their duties ineffectively.

5.1 Conclusion and Recommendation

As a conclusion, this study aimed to investigate the most frequent effect of organisational communication towards employees' productivity and the significant relationship between educational background and employees' organisational communication. It was found that organisational communication enhances the relationship between managers and employees and contributes to transparent communication. When employees have effective communication with the managers, they can have an open discussion in completing the task. Furthermore, it was found that educational background has a significant relationship towards effective organisational communication. Employees with strong education fundamentals were able to analyse various situations and provide feasible solutions, which can impact the overall communication in the organisation.

This study would recommend future research should spend more time on conducting the topic. This is because there are plenty of past studies that could be found on organisational communication, employee productivity, performance, job satisfaction, the importance of communication and so on. However, due to time constraints, the term educational background is very lacking for researchers to study it. Spending more time on doing research could help the researchers to have a more depth understanding of the topic. Therefore, provide a details and sufficient content explanation to the readers. In addition, this study also helps future research to frame a concept on the impact of effective organisational communication on employees' productivity.

6.0 References

- Ahmed, T., Khan, M. S., Thitivesa, D., Siraphatthada, Y., & Phumdara, T. (2020). Impact of employees engagement and knowledge sharing on organizational performance: Study of HR challenges in COVID-19 pandemic. *Human Systems Management*, 39(4), 589-601.
- Ali, B. J., Anwar, G., Gardi, B., Jabbar Othman, B., Mahmood Aziz, H., Ali Ahmed, S., ... & Sabir, B. Y. (2021). Business communication strategies: analysis of internal communication processes. Ali, BJ, Anwar, G., Gardi, B., Othman, BJ, Aziz, HM, Ahmed, SA, Hamza, PA, Ismael, NB, Sorguli, S., Sabir, BY (2021). Business Communication Strategies: Analysis of Internal Communication Processes. *Journal of Humanities and Education Development*, 3(3), 16-38.
- Amin, I. B. B. M. (2022). The impact of performance appraisal on employees' productivity in electrical manufacturing sector at Penang, Malaysia. *Journal of Positive School Psychology*, 6(4), 6938 – 6948.
- AP, D. S., & Leon, F. M. (2021, February). Employee Education Background on Credit Risk Defining Factors of Islamic Banking in Indonesia and Malaysia. In 4th International Conference on Research of Educational Administration and Management (ICREAM 2020) (pp. 344-349). Atlantis Press.
- Bojadjiev, M. I., & Vaneva, M. (2021). The impact of COVID-19 crisis on a company's internal communication. *Interdisciplinary Description of Complex Systems: INDECS*, 19(2), 239-256.
- Cletus, H. E., Mahmood, N. A., Umar, A., & Ibrahim, A. D. (2018). Prospects and challenges of workplace diversity in modern day organizations: A Critical Review. 9(2), 35-52.
- Gendron, B. (2022, March 30). How the Lack of Training Affects Your Organization. The Training Associates.
- Habas, C. (2020, July 27). Cultural & Language Barriers in the Workforce. *Small Business - Chron.com*.

Ibrahim, A. U., & Daniel, C. O. (2019). Impact of leadership on organisational performance. *International Journal of Business, Management and Social Research*, 6(2), 367-374.

Insecurity: The Moderating Effect of Organisational Communication.

Kalogiannidis, S. (2020, December). Impact of effective business communication on employee performance. *European Journal of Business and Management Research*, 5(6).

Kalogiannidis, S. (2021, December 2). Business trust and communication as predictors of business growth. *WSEAS TRANSACTIONS on BUSINESS and ECONOMICS*.

Karoso, S., Riinawati, R., Ilham, R. N., Rais, R. G. P., & Latifa, D. (2022). Analyzing the Relationship of Work Environment and Quality of Work Life on Employee Performance: The Mediating Role of Organizational Commitment. *Journal of Madani Society*, 1(3), 167-173.

Kashyap, V. (2021, December 16). Effective Communication in the Workplace: How and Why? *Spiceworks*.

Kwak, S. (2023, May 3). Are Only p-Values Less Than 0.05 Significant? A p-Value Greater Than 0.05 Is Also Significant! *J Lipid Atheroscler*, 12(2), 89–95.

Lee, Y., Li, J. Y., & Sunny Tsai, W. H. (2021). Diversity-oriented leadership, internal communication, and employee outcomes: A perspective of racial minority employees. *Journal of public relations research*, 33(5), 314-334.

Liszniansky, H. (2021, December 16). What Is A Knowledge Gap? Less Than 100 Words. *Roundtable Learning*.

Markovic, M. R., & Salamzadeh, A. (2018). The importance of communication in business management. *The 7th International Scientific Conference on Employment, Education and Entrepreneurship*, Belgrade, Serbia.

Mercader, V., Galván-Vela, E., Ravina-Ripoll, R., & Gh.Popescu, C. R. (2021, November 1). A focus on ethical value under the vision of leadership, teamwork, effective communication and productivity. *Journal of Risk and Financial Management*, 14, 522.

Moletsane, M., Tefera, O., & Migiros, S. (2019, March). The relationship between employee engagement and organisational productivity of sugar industry in South Africa : the employees' perspective. *African Journal of Business and Economic Research*, 14(1), 113-134.

Paais, M., & Pattiruhu, J. R. (2020, July 9). Effect of motivation, leadership, and organizational culture on satisfaction and employee performance. *Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business*, 7(8), 577-588.

- Ramadhani, L. I., & Simanjuntak, L. Y. (2020). The Effect of Education Background and Work Experience on Employee Ethics at PT. Timbang Deli Indonesia. *Journal of Management Science (JMAS)*, 3(3), 91-97.
- Rismayadi, B., & Sumarni, N. (2023). Employee Performance Reviewed By Leadership and Work Discipline at the East Cikarang District Office. *Edutran Business and Management*, 1(2), 34-40.
- Salem, C. (2019, January 23). What Influences Communication? LinkedIn. <https://www.linkedin.com/pulse/what-influences-communication-christopher-salem/>
- Sapungan,, R. M. P.D., Kashiwagi, S. A. A., Legaspi, D. B., Lopez, D. M. O., Lat, D. L. S., & Malabanan, M. R. L. (2019, August). Communication barriers in the workplace. - *International Journal of Innovative Science, Engineering & Technology*, 6(8), 2348 – 7968.
- Setiyani, A., Djumarno, Riyanto, S., & Nawangsari, L. C. (2019). The effect of work environment on flexible working hours, employee engagement and employee motivation. *Eco Journals*, 9(3), 112-116. :
- Stachová, K., Papula, J., Stacho, Z., & Kohnová, L. (2019, January 11). External Partnerships in Employee Education and Development as the Key to Facing Industry 4.0 Challenges. *Sustainability*, 11(2), 345.
- Stefania, S., & Spiridnova, T. (2022). The Impact of Digitalisation on Perceived Job
- Tanveera, A., Shahid, K. M., Duangkamol, T., Yananda, S., & Tawatb, P. (2020, November 11). Impact of employees engagement and knowledge sharing on organizational performance: Study of HR challenges in COVID-19 pandemic. *Human Systems Management*, 39(4), 589-601.
- Teo, S. T., Bentley, T., & Nguyen, D. (2020). Psychosocial work environment, work engagement, and employee commitment: A moderated, mediation model. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 88, 102415.

For instructions on how to order reprints of this article, please visit our website: <https://ejbm.apu.edu.my/> ©Asia Pacific University of Technology and Innovation